

Computer-Based
Medical Consultations:
MYCIN

ELSEVIER COMPUTER SCIENCE LIBRARY

Operating and Programming Systems Series

Peter J. Denning, Editor

1. *Halstead* A Laboratory Manual for Compiler and Operating System Implementation
- Spirn* Program Behavior: Models and Measurement (in prep.)

Programming Languages Series

Thomas E. Cheatham, Editor

1. *Heindel and Roberto* LANG-PAK—An Interactive Language Design System
2. *Wulf et al.* The Design of an Optimizing Compiler
3. *Maurer* The Programmer's Introduction to SNOBOL

Cleaveland and Uzgalis Grammars for Programming Languages (in prep.)

Hecht Global Code Improvement (in prep.)

Theory of Computation Series

Patrick C. Fischer, Editor

1. *Borodin and Munro* The Computational Complexity of Algebraic and Numeric Problems

Computer Design and Architecture Series

Edward J. McCluskey, Editor

1. *Salisbury* Microprogrammable Computer Architectures
2. *Svobodova* Computer Performance Evaluation: Analysis and Application (in prep.)
3. *Wakerly* Error-Detecting Codes, Self-Checking Circuits and Applications (in prep.)

Artificial Intelligence Series

Nils J. Nilsson, Editor

1. *Sussman* A Computer Model of Skill Acquisition
2. *Shortliffe* Computer-Based Medical Consultations: MYCIN

2

ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE SERIES

Computer-Based
Medical Consultations:
MYCIN

Edward Hance Shortliffe, Ph.D.

Division of Clinical Pharmacology, Stanford University School of Medicine



ELSEVIER

New York Oxford Amsterdam

AMERICAN ELSEVIER PUBLISHING COMPANY, INC.
52 Vanderbilt Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10017

ELSEVIER SCIENTIFIC PUBLISHING COMPANY
335 Jan Van Galenstraat, P.O. Box 211
Amsterdam, The Netherlands

©American Elsevier Publishing Co., Inc., 1976

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Shortliffe, Edward Hance.
Computer-based medical consultations, MYCIN.

(Artificial intelligence series ; 2) (Elsevier
computer science library)

1. MYCIN (Electronic computer system) 2. Medicine—
Data processing. I. Title.

OR46.S53

616'.0028'54

75-39769

ISBN 0-444-00179-4

ISBN 0-444-00180-8 pbk.

Manufactured in the United States of America

This book has been adapted in large part from the author's doctoral thesis [Shortliffe, 1974b]. Portions of the work appeared previously in *Computers And Biomedical Research* [Shortliffe, 1973, 1975b], *Mathematical Biosciences* [Shortliffe, 1975a], and the *Proceedings Of The Thirteenth San Diego Biomedical Symposium* [Shortliffe, 1974a].

*To Stanford's Medical Scientist Training Program,
which is supported by
the National Institutes of Health*

Contents

| | |
|---|--------------|
| PREFACE | xiii |
| FOREWORD | xviii |
| CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.1 Computer Applications in Medicine | 1 |
| 1.1.1 Problems and Promises | 1 |
| 1.1.2 Medical Computing Application Areas | 3 |
| Business Applications • Biomedical Engineering • Multi-Phasic Health Testing • Automated Medical Records • Laboratory and Pharmacy Systems • Hospital Information Systems • Decision Support Systems • Computer-Aided Instruction in Medicine | |
| 1.2 Artificial Intelligence | 13 |
| 1.2.1 Areas of Application | 14 |
| Game-Playing • Math, Science, and Engineering Aids • Automatic Theorem Proving • Automatic Programming • Robots • Machine Vision • Natural Language Systems • Information Processing Psychology | |
| 1.2.2 AI Methodologies and Techniques | 17 |
| Modeling and Representation of Knowledge • Reasoning, Deduction, and Problem Solving • Heuristic Search • AI Systems and Languages | |
| 1.3 Computer-Assisted Medical Decision Making | 20 |
| 1.3.1 Major Problem Area | 20 |
| 1.3.2 Data Retrieval as a Decision Aid | 23 |
| 1.3.3 Decisions Based on Numerical Computations | 24 |
| 1.3.4 Probabilistic Approaches to Decision Making | 25 |
| 1.3.5 Artificial Intelligence and Medical Decisions | 28 |
| 1.3.6 Philosophical Observations | 32 |
| 1.4 Antimicrobial Selection | 36 |
| 1.4.1 Nature of the Decision Problem | 36 |
| Is the Infection Significant? • What is the Organism's Identity? • | |

MYCIN

| | |
|--|-----------|
| What are the Potentially Useful Drugs? • Which Drug is Best for this Patient? | |
| 1.4.2 Evidence that Assistance is Needed | 41 |
| 1.5 MYCIN System | 44 |
| 1.5.1 System's Organization | 44 |
| 1.5.2 Sample Consultation Session | 47 |
| CHAPTER 2. DESIGN CONSIDERATIONS FOR MYCIN | 63 |
| 2.1 Introduction | 63 |
| 2.2 Design Considerations for Consultation Programs | 64 |
| 2.2.1 Program Should be Useful | 65 |
| 2.2.2 Program Should be Educational when Appropriate | 67 |
| 2.2.3 Program Should be Able to Explain Its Advice | 67 |
| 2.2.4 Program Should be Able to Understand Questions | 68 |
| 2.2.5 Program Should be Able to Acquire New Knowledge | 68 |
| 2.2.6 Program's Knowledge-Base Should be Easily Modified | 70 |
| 2.3 MYCIN and Acceptability Criteria | 71 |
| 2.3.1 Modularity to Insure Straightforward Modification | 71 |
| 2.3.2 Ability to Acquire New Knowledge from Experts | 72 |
| 2.3.3 Ability to Understand Questions | 74 |
| 2.3.4 Ability to Explain Decisions | 75 |
| 2.3.5 Educational Capabilities | 77 |
| 2.3.6 General Usefulness | 77 |
| CHAPTER 3. CONSULTATION SYSTEM | 79 |
| 3.1 Introduction | 79 |
| 3.2 System Knowledge | 80 |
| 3.2.1 Decision Rules | 80 |
| Previous Rule-Based Systems • Representation of Rules | 89 |
| 3.2.2 Categorization of Rules by Context | 89 |
| Context Tree • Interrelationship of Rules and Context Tree | 93 |
| 3.2.3 Clinical Parameters | 93 |
| Three Kinds of Clinical Parameters • Classification and Representation of Parameters | 98 |
| 3.2.4 Certainty Factors | 98 |

Contents

| | | |
|------------|--|------------|
| 3.2.5 | Functions for Evaluation of Premise Conditions | 101 |
| 3.2.6 | Static Knowledge Structures | 108 |
| | Tabular and List-Based Knowledge • Specialized Functions | |
| 3.2.7 | Translation of Rules into English | 112 |
| 3.3 | Use of Rules to Give Advice | 113 |
| 3.3.1 | Previous Goal-Oriented Problem Solving Systems | 113 |
| 3.3.2 | MYCIN's Control Structure | 119 |
| | Consequent Rules and Recursion • Asking Questions of User | |
| 3.3.3 | Creation of Dynamic Data Base | 129 |
| | Data Acquired from User • Data Inferred by System • Creating an Ongoing Consultation Record | |
| 3.3.4 | Self-Referencing Rules | 134 |
| 3.3.5 | Preventing Reasoning Loops | 135 |
| 3.4 | Propagation of Context Tree | 137 |
| 3.4.1 | Data Structures Used for Sprouting Branches | 137 |
| 3.4.2 | Explicit Mechanisms for Branching | 141 |
| 3.4.3 | Implicit Mechanisms for Branching | 141 |
| 3.5 | Selection of Therapy | 142 |
| 3.5.1 | Creation of Potential Therapy List | 142 |
| 3.5.2 | Selecting Preferred Drug from List | 144 |
| | Choosing Apparent First Choice Drug Rule-Based Screening for Contraindications | |
| 3.6 | Mechanisms for Storage of Patient Data | 148 |
| 3.6.1 | Changing Answers to Questions | 148 |
| 3.6.2 | Remembering Patients for Future Reference | 150 |
| | Evaluating New Rules • Re-evaluating Patient Cases | |
| 3.7 | Future Extensions | 151 |
| 3.7.1 | Dynamic Ordering of Rules | 151 |
| 3.7.2 | Dynamic Ordering of Conditions within Rules | 152 |
| 3.7.3 | Pre-Screening of Rules | 153 |
| 3.7.4 | Placing all Knowledge in Rules | 153 |
| 3.7.5 | Need for Context Graph | 154 |
| 3.8 | Advantages of MYCIN Approach | 154 |
| 3.8.1 | Modularity of Knowledge | 155 |
| 3.8.2 | Dynamic Reasoning Chain | 155 |
| 3.8.3 | Domain-Independent Control Structure | 157 |
| 3.8.4 | Reasoning with Judgmental Knowledge | 157 |

MYCIN

| | |
|---|------------|
| CHAPTER 4. MODEL OF INEXACT REASONING IN MEDICINE | 159 |
| 4.1 Introduction | 159 |
| 4.2 Problem Formulation | 161 |
| 4.3 MYCIN's Rule-Based Approach | 164 |
| 4.4 Theoretical Background | 167 |
| 4.5 Proposed Model of Evidential Strength | 168 |
| 4.6 Model as Approximation Technique | 176 |
| 4.7 MYCIN's Use of Model | 185 |
| Appendices | 188 |
| 4.A Paradox of Ravens | 188 |
| 4.B Proof of Upper Limit | 192 |
| CHAPTER 5. EXPLANATION SYSTEM | 195 |
| 5.1 Introduction | 195 |
| 5.2 Using Question-Answering System | 197 |
| 5.2.1 Rule-Retrieval Questions | 197 |
| General Questions • Questions Regarding Current Consultation | |
| 5.2.2 Questions Regarding Dynamic Base Data | 200 |
| IQ Questions • EQ Command | |
| 5.2.3 Additional Options | 202 |
| 5.3 Future Extensions | 203 |
| CHAPTER 6. FUTURE DIRECTIONS FOR MYCIN | 205 |
| 6.1 Introduction | 205 |
| 6.2 Plans for Immediate Future | 206 |
| 6.3 Knowledge Acquisition | 207 |
| 6.3.1 Current Status of Rule-Acquisition | 208 |
| Subprogram 3 • Interaction of Old and New Rules • Impact of Knowledge Growth on System Performance | |
| 6.3.2 Future Extensions | 215 |
| 6.4 Evaluation of MYCIN | 217 |
| 6.4.1 Reliability of MYCIN's Advice | 218 |
| 6.4.2 MYCIN's Acceptability to Physicians | 219 |
| 6.4.3 MYCIN's Impact on Prescribing Habits | 219 |
| 6.4.4 MYCIN's Impact on Patient Care | 220 |
| 6.4.5 Speed, Efficiency, and Storage Requirements | 221 |
| 6.4.6 Cost of MYCIN's Consultations | 223 |
| 6.5 MYCIN and Shared Data Bases | 224 |
| 6.6 Prospective Monitoring of Prescribing Habits | 226 |

Contents

| | |
|---|------------|
| 6.7 Educational Applications | 230 |
| 6.8 Other Applications of MYCIN Formalism | 231 |
| CHAPTER 7. CONCLUSION | 233 |
| 7.1 Summary | 233 |
| 7.1.1 The Clinical Problem | 233 |
| 7.1.2 The Solution | 235 |
| 7.2 Limitations of MYCIN's Approach | 236 |
| 7.3 Contribution to Computer-Based Medical Decision Making | 238 |
| 7.4 Contribution to AI | 239 |
| REFERENCES | 243 |
| INDEX | 261 |